

**EXHIBIT 16**

Whelen documents with beginning Bates numbers  
SYN04578617, SYN04604097, SYN04579192, SYN04730519,  
SYN04579107, SYN04730589, SYN04587417, SYN04742765,  
SYN04751299, SYN04756053, SYN0458616, SYN03990835,  
SYN03990870

ACSH Project Techniques

To make sure that all possible scientific data is included, and to disseminate the information as widely as possible, we proceed in the following manner:

1. We will produce a scientific review paper, suitable for publication in a peer-reviewed journal. This project will be supervised by our permanent staff, and will be authored by one or more of the eminent physician-scientists; these may be selected from our panel of scientific and medical advisors, or may be an outside expert. This publication will also be available for distribution to health professionals with interest in the topic. It will be posted on our site.
2. We will alter the language—"consumerize" it—to make the paper consumer- and media-friendly, and post it on our web site ([www.acsh.org](http://www.acsh.org)), as well as on our health webzine *HealthFactsandFears.com*
3. We will distribute this version widely to our approximately 15,000 email subscribers to our "Updates from ACSH" listserve, as well as to government regulators and legislators; and we will make printed copies available for purchase.
4. We will utilize our recently-acquired *Vocus* software to efficiently target journalists and media personalities with specific interests in the topic at hand. *Vocus* allows ACSH staff to address publications, press releases, and other items directly to interested parties across the U.S., with immediate feedback and monitoring as well.
5. Our professional staff will be available to field queries from the media on this topic, and we can also call on our council of scientific advisors to lend additional expertise. We will write articles and op-eds based on our research findings, again with an eye towards widest possible dissemination.
6. Should additional funding become available, we will organize and hold a media seminar/symposium, to which we will invite health and science writers and editors to hear experts in relevant fields, e.g.,



**FILED UNDER SEAL**  
**Atrazine EXPOSED Unsealed by the Court & Exposed by SourceWatch**

---

**From:** Carroll Beth USGR  
**Sent:** Thursday, May 24, 2007 2:47 PM  
**To:** McFarland Janis USGR; Breckenridge Charles USGR; Farmer Danelle USGR; Flakne Dave USGR; Ford Sherry USGR; Herli Peter USGR; Hendley Paul USGR; Hosmer Alan USGR; Pastoor Tim USGR; Tierney Dennis USGR; Vanausdeln Michael USGR  
**Cc:** Dickson Gary USGR  
**Subject:** FW: Letter re: ""Top 10 stupid environmental policies of the Bush Administration." 5/15/07

This went to ES&T today from the American Council on Science & Health  
-NBC

---

**From:** Gilbert Ross [mailto:rossg@acsh.org]  
**Sent:** Thursday, May 24, 2007 2:33 PM  
**To:** est@acs.org  
**Cc:** est@uiowa.edu; jschnoor@engineering.uiowa.edu  
**Subject:** Letter re: ""Top 10 stupid environmental policies of the Bush Administration." 5/15/07

Managing Editor  
ES&T

To the Editor:

As executive director of the science-based consumer education organization, The American Council on Science and Health, I take issue with your inclusion of "Failure to ban the herbicide atrazine" as one of your "Top 10 stupid environmental policies of the Bush Administration."  
(ES&T, May 15th 2007, 41(10))

Atrazine is among the most effective herbicides available to modern agriculture, and has been safely used for five decades. While concentrations have been detected in various waterways, that is not in itself a cause for concern, nor for the alarm your endorsement of a ban on its use implies. The relation of exposure to atrazine and developmental abnormalities in amphibians has not been established scientifically; there is nothing wrong with calling for monitoring and further study before resorting to an outright ban.

Contrary to your assertion, the Canadian authorities seemingly agree, as atrazine is not in fact in jeopardy, having recently been approved by several preliminary bodies.

Atrazine has been studied more thoroughly than any other agricultural herbicide, and no adverse effect on human health has been suggested, while its impact on the environment has not been shown to be detrimental. A ban now would be premature and counterproductive.

Gilbert Ross M.D.  
Executive and Medical Director  
The American Council on Science and Health  
1995 Broadway  
New York NY 10023  
212-362-7044 x242  
cell 516-581-8400  
[rossg@acsh.org](mailto:rossg@acsh.org)  
fax 212-362-4919



# FILED UNDER SEAL

**Atrazine** **EXPOSED** Unsealed by the Court & Exposed by SourceWatch

**FILED UNDER SEAL**  
**Atrazine EXPOSED Unsealed by the Court & Exposed by SourceWatch**

---

**From:** Schoenmaeckers Medard CHBS  
**Sent:** Monday, August 24, 2009 11:56 AM  
**To:** Ford Sherry USGR; Orchard David CHBS  
**Cc:** Adelman Jessica USWS; Howard Chris USGR; Nadel Alan USGR  
**Subject:** RE: ATTY CLIENT PRIVILEGED & CONFIDENTIAL: FW: Atrazine and Twitter  
**Attachments:** image001.jpg; image002.jpg; image003.gif; image004.jpg; image005.gif; image006.jpg; image007.jpg

Apologies, here's a new link [www.twitter.com/syngenta](http://www.twitter.com/syngenta) (the other one is for the logged-in user).

Médard

---

**From:** Schoenmaeckers Medard CHBS  
**Sent:** Montag, 24. August 2009 18:55  
**To:** Ford Sherry USGR; Orchard David CHBS  
**Cc:** Adelman Jessica USWS; Howard Chris USGR; Nadel Alan USGR  
**Subject:** RE: ATTY CLIENT PRIVILEGED & CONFIDENTIAL: FW: Atrazine and Twitter

Sherry,

Following our telcon, here's a link to the tweet we just put out: <http://twitter.com/home> (discussed and approved by Carsten and Jonathan).

Médard

---

**From:** Ford Sherry USGR  
**Sent:** Montag, 24. August 2009 18:06  
**To:** Schoenmaeckers Medard CHBS; Orchard David CHBS  
**Cc:** Adelman Jessica USWS; Howard Chris USGR; Nadel Alan USGR  
**Subject:** RE: ATTY CLIENT PRIVILEGED & CONFIDENTIAL: FW: Atrazine and Twitter

Yes, we would like to proactively point people to positive stories like the ACSH opinion piece ([http://www.acsh.org/factsfears/newsID.1230/news\\_detail.asp](http://www.acsh.org/factsfears/newsID.1230/news_detail.asp)) and some of the positive mini-releases we've been sending out. Thanks for your help.

---

**From:** Schoenmaeckers Medard CHBS  
**Sent:** Monday, August 24, 2009 12:00 PM  
**To:** Ford Sherry USGR; Orchard David CHBS  
**Cc:** Adelman Jessica USWS; Howard Chris USGR; Nadel Alan USGR  
**Subject:** RE: ATTY CLIENT PRIVILEGED & CONFIDENTIAL: FW: Atrazine and Twitter

We can do it instantly, technology is not the problem. It's more a matter of strategy, but an option I'm happy to explore. Do I understand that the viewpoint in the US to proactively point at our viewpoint? Will discuss it in Basel and revert.

Médard

---

**From:** Ford Sherry USGR  
**Sent:** Montag, 24. August 2009 17:47  
**To:** Schoenmaeckers Medard CHBS; Orchard David CHBS  
**Cc:** Adelman Jessica USWS; Howard Chris USGR; Nadel Alan USGR

# FILED UNDER SEAL

**Atrazine EXPOSED Unsealed by the Court & Exposed by SourceWatch**

**Subject:** ATTY CLIENT PRIVILEGED & CONFIDENTIAL: FW: Atrazine and Twitter

**Importance:** High

David and Medard—Please see below some examples of the Tweets that we're finding related to the NYT piece on atrazine. Is there any way we can take advantage of our existing global Twitter account to post some links to positive atrazine articles and/or releases? Or perhaps to open a US Twitter account for this purpose?

Thanks for considering.

Best,  
Sherry

---

**From:** Tricia Sheehan [mailto:TSheehan@gibbs-soell.com]

**Sent:** Monday, August 24, 2009 11:26 AM

**To:** Ford Sherry USGR

**Cc:** Laura Temple

**Subject:** Atrazine and Twitter

**Importance:** High

Sherry –

Following are a few sample postings from Twitter today – most link back to the NYT article/graphics.

If possible, it would be good to be able to do some Syngenta Twitter posts along with a link to the Syngenta mini-releases on atrazine.com. And, we could re-tweet links to a couple of the positive articles (Peoria article, American Council on Science or Health blog, etc.). This would help keep some of the positive news out there toward the top of searches.

We could look to use the Global Twitter account, or if possible we could set up a U.S. Twitter account or something specific to atrazine.

Let me know if you need any other information as you pass this along, and what you learn about using Twitter.

Thanks,  
Tricia

\*\*\*\*\*

- [JoshatNRDC](#) Report on **atrazine** contamination of US waters is out: press conference in Chicago @11 & telebriefing @1 central. <http://bit.ly/14c88>

- [reefmonitor](#) yearly average levels of **atrazine** in drinking water violate federal standards: Illinois, Indiana, Ohio, Kansas [youtube.com/watch?v=9iJQvrEOljU](http://youtube.com/watch?v=9iJQvrEOljU) 33 minutes ago from web





- [LeeJStoltzfus](#) **Atrazine** weed killer banned in Europe because of cancer etc. But here we drink it our water. <http://tinyurl.com/nugjut> Drinking toxic water about 1 hour ago from web

- [InvasiveNotes](#) RT @Lake\_Champlain: Debating Just How Much **Atrazine** Is Safe in yr Water Glass - Series - NYTimes.com - <http://shar.es/TfNe> via @RainGardens about 2 hours ago from TweetDeck

- [Lake\\_Champlain](#) Debating Just How Much **Atrazine** Is Safe in Your Water Glass - Series - NYTimes.com - <http://shar.es/TfNe> via @RainGardens about 2 hours ago from TweetDeck

# FILED UNDER SEAL

**Atrazine EXPOSED** Unsealed by the Court & Exposed by SourceWatch

-  [NRDCSwitchboard](#) New data confirms widespread **atrazine** contamination in drinking water and streams. NRDC Report: In today's new .. <http://bit.ly/6V8T2> about 2 hours ago from [twitterfeed](#) \_
-  [green\\_babe](#) #NYT finds unsafe levels of **atrazine** in drinking water in 6 states and that #EPA too slow in evaluating emerging risks <http://tiny.cc/14poM> about 8 hours ago from [web](#) \_
-  [BonnieHoffman](#) Link: Debating Just How Much **Atrazine** Is Safe in Your Water Glass - Series - NYTimes.com <http://tinyurl.com/la6xug> about 8 hours ago from [web](#) \_
-  [gbittlingmayer](#) % of pop exposed to weed killer **Atrazine** in tap water is highest in #Kansas. **Atrazine** is banned in Europe. See NYT map <http://bit.ly/hGcxn> about 10 hours ago from [web](#)

Tricia Sheehan  
Managing Supervisor  
Gibbs & Soell Public Relations  
Phone: 847.519.9150  
Fax: 847.519.1877  
E-mail: [tsheehan@gibbs-suell.com](mailto:tsheehan@gibbs-suell.com)



# FILED UNDER SEAL

**Atrazine EXPOSED** Unsealed by the Court & Exposed by SourceWatch

**From:** Adelman Jessica USWS  
**Sent:** Friday, August 28, 2009 10:08 AM  
**To:** Goldsmith Steven USGR; Ford Sherry USGR  
**Subject:** FW: In the News - 8/28/2009

Great piece here -- she is the one who did the good job the other day on MSNBC? She's a great weapon. Well done - JCA

## NYT Terrifies Over "Weed Killers" in Water

American Council on Science and Health  
22 August 2009

All the news that's fit to scare. That was the thrust of this weekend's New York Times article by Charles Duhigg entitled "Toxic Waters: Debating Just How Much Weed Killer Is Safe in Your Water Glass."

As president of the American Council on Science and Health, I have been following environmental and health media articles for some three decades -- seeing how they measure up in terms of "honors" for exaggerated risk, biased reporting, misrepresented science, and pure sensationalism. The Duhigg article is clearly a contender for the all-time worst.

Duhigg argues that the widespread use of the herbicide atrazine is polluting our supply of drinking water and putting us all -- but particularly pregnant women -- at risk. He consistently refers to "recent studies" (but does not cite them) and concerned "scientists and health advocates" (but does not name any mainstream experts) who think that the Environmental Protection Agency is not protecting us from atrazine -- and that the manufacturers of the herbicide are somehow poisoning us. He cites "new research" showing that atrazine is hazardous even at low levels but does not specify his sources. He seems oblivious to the work of the most famous early toxicologist (Paracelsus, circa 1500) who set in place the time-honored premise: only the dose makes the poison.

Atrazine is a widely used herbicide -- applied on a variety of crops (corn, sugar cane, sorghum, and more). It is a tightly regulated chemical, and levels in water (where there could be spill-off from agricultural or other applications) are closely monitored by environmental agencies. It has been in safe use for over fifty years. There is a huge "safety factor" built in -- so that permitted trace levels are some hundred-fold less than what could have an adverse effect on human health. The Safe Drinking Water Act requires monitoring water for a multitude of chemicals, including atrazine. You would drown from drinking the huge amounts of water needed for you to be affected by trace levels of atrazine in any American water supply.

Duhigg appears to be playing to the fears (phobias) of consumers who (a) do not know where their food comes from -- and are unaware that without the use of agricultural chemicals like atrazine (which allow farmers to fight weeds, insects and disease) our food supply would be diminished by about half -- and (b) think that even a trace amount of any "chemical" in food, water, air, or consumer products is intolerable. The reality, of course, is that everything, including natural foods, is comprised of chemicals -- most of which are toxic and/or carcinogenic in animals at high dose but are perfectly safe when we consume them.

How much "weed killer" in your water is safe? Well, how much arsenic in your natural baked potato is safe? (Arsenic occurs naturally in potatoes.) The mere ability to detect a chemical in a substance -- in food, air, water, consumer products, or even human tissue -- does not signal that there is a public health hazard.

Nowadays, when we have so many serious public health risks to face (cigarette smoking, obesity, swine flu, and more), Duhigg has given top priority to a bogus risk. And this is irresponsible. As a result of his article, he hopes that Americans will be demanding zero tolerance for atrazine in the water supply -- and we will incur huge expenses to accomplish this dubious goal, with absolutely no resulting health benefits, since there were never any health risks in the first place. Even the Environmental Protection Agency (the most stringent regulatory agency in the world and the most powerful, not known for downplaying chemical risks) stated that atrazine posed no known health risks when they approved re-registration of it in 2006. EPA has evaluated hundreds of studies finding "no evidence of a link to birth defects."



# FILED UNDER SEAL

## Atrazine EXPOSED Unsealed by the Court & Exposed by SourceWatch

So why did the New York Times give such prominent coverage to a bogus risk? It is part of a general wave of "chemophobia." Earlier this month, the Times accepted a paid advertisement (an "op-ad") on their editorial page, paid for (at a price of about \$50,000) by New York's prestigious Mount Sinai Hospital and Medical Center. The paid-for editorial copy claimed that industrial "chemicals" (phthalates, BPA, etc.) were imperiling our children, when there was no basis whatsoever for such an assertion.

So it is "in" to scare people about "chemicals" in their air, food, water, and consumer products -- and apparently Mr. Duhigg and the Times elected to exploit this phobia. Unfortunately, scaring people about the quality and safety of their drinking water is not only without scientific basis, it is completely counter-productive, distracting us from the real public health hazards we face today.

By Elizabeth M. Whelan, Sc.D., M.P.H., president of the American Council on Science and Health (ACSH.org)

**From:** Barnes Andrea (ext) USGR

**Sent:** Friday, August 28, 2009 10:10 AM

**To:** Abbott John USGR; Adelman Jessica USWS; Akins Jonathan USGR; Allan Gregg CAGU; Alvarez Graciela MXMC; Alventosa Vince USGR; Arino Gigi USGR; Bassi Bobby USGR; Becker Barbara CHBS; Beidler Tom USGR; Bell Margaret USGR; Belles David USGR; Bennett Wayne CAGU; Bernens Jack USMN; Beutke Bill USGR; Blackney Barbara USGR; Bradshaw Jay CAGU; Breckenridge Charles USGR; Braggi Neal USRE; Brownell Keith USGR; Brune Elaine USGR; Bryan Ann USGR; Bumell Keith USGR; Calhoun Wendell USGR; Carpino Don USGR; Carroll Beth USGR; Cholewa Jeanne USMN; Christensen Thomas USGR; Covington Susan USGR; Crouse George USGR; Dawson Kim USGR; Delp Bryan USVB; DeMers Mary USGR; Dickinson Travis USGR; Dodson Jo Heather USGR; Drotschmann Alex USGR; Duan James USGR; Dufort Marianne USGR; Eichlin Kathy USGR; Elser David CHBS; Escalante Roberto MXMC; Fischer Valdemar USGR; Fister Ken USGR; Flippin Charles USGR; Flores Maurilio MXMC; Ford Sherry USGR; Foresman Chuck USGR; Freed John USGR; Garman Chip USGR; Goldsmith Steven USGR; Gonzalez-Valero Juan CHBS; Graef Henry USUW; Hackett Dennis USGR; Haley Jacqueline USGR; Hamilton Tom USGR; Hawkins Vern USGR; Hendley Paul USGR; Henry Kevin USGR; Hertl Peter USGR; Hinderliter Daniel USGR; Hook Barbara USGR; Howard Chris USGR; Howard Stott USDM; Hull Sarah CHBS; Hundley David USGR; Irrig Heidi USGR; Jackson Tommy CAGU; Jenkins Jim USDM; Johnson Jim USDM; Kelly Angus USWS; Kelly Dennis USGR; Kimm Jay USDM; Klages Nathan CAGU; Klaveano Ryan USRS; Kuhn Eric USGR; Lachney Ralph USGR; Langkamp Scott USGR; Larson Ross USDM; Lawson Scott USGR; Licata John USGR; Ligon Steve USMN; Lower Geoffrey USGR; Mack Mike CHBS; Macken Kevin USMN; McFarland Janis USGR; Miller Stephanie USGR; Mitchell John USGR; Mollitor Pam USMN; Moreira Eduardo USGR; Moricle Lisa USGR; Moseley Carroll USGR; Moss Michael USGR; Nadel Alan USGR; Neill Rob CHBS; Nicholson Michael USSG; Ouzts Clark USGR; Palma Evelyne CHBS; Paoli Gerry USGR; Pastoor Tim USGR; Pearson Charles USGR; Peters Greg USGR; Peters James H USGR; Peters Jeff USGR; Pinon David USGR; Pulliam Keelan USGR; Pyle Steve USGR; Quarles Beth USGR; Ramsey Mickey USGR; Ratliff Randy USGR; Reasons Scott USGR; Riggs Laurie USGR; Rios Francisco MXMC; Rose Dan CHBS; Salas Guadalupe MXMC; Sandlin Lynn USGR; Santanam Ramesh USGR; Shivrain Vinod USGR; Somody Carol USGR; Zingg Carmen USBO; Barlow Todd USGR; Chaudhuri Sumita USRE; Clemens Christopher USGR; Collins Ashley USRE; Cueva James USGR; Currie Angela USGR; Day Lloyd USWS; DeRose Rick USRE; DiPaola Michael USGR; Dowling Luis USMN; Farmer Danelle USGR; Flakne Dave USGR; Glasgow Les USGR; Gonzalez Ivan CHBS; Goolsby Robert USMN; Hanes-Miller Amber USBO; Holzworth Brad USGR; Ibarra Rodolfo MXMC; Jalthaide; Jepson Ian USRE; Langley Chris USGR; Lara Angel USRE; Lee Erica USGR; Lord Melissa USGR; Lycan Darren USGR; Marten Sebastian CHBS; Martin Rex USGR; Miano Jeffrey USRE; Micali Juliana USGR; Milan Jose USGR; Miranda Marybeth USRE; Olah Kriszta CHBS; Pauwels Dimitri CHBS; Pizzo Emanuele CHBS; Plunket Bob USGR; Porter Don USGR; Powell Joe; Razo Carly USGR; Renner Rob USGR; Savinelli Caydee USGR; Schmidt Lynn CAGU; Schuyler Jack USGR; Schwenke Stephanie USGR; Shah Jigar USGR; Sharma Shachi CHBS; Shaw Jennifer USGR; Shaw Judy CAGU; Sheehan Tricia; Shope Matthew USGR; Sippell Dave CAAR; Smith Jeff USGR; Spain Steve USGR; Staton Tanja USGR; Stavola Pat USGR; Steffens John USRE; Stewart Rich USGR; Strong Neil USGR; Stypa Marian USGR; Suarez Fernando USGR; Sutton Rick USGR; Tally Allison USGR; Tao Joan USGR; Tedford Eric USGR; Teoli William USGR; Tierney Timothy USMN; Tilger Carsten CHBS; Tout Nancy CAGU; Tuckis Jeffrey USRE; Turner Kendall USDM; Vail Gordon USGR; Venello Jason USGR; Walker Martin CHBS; Wall Sharie USGR; Warner Simon USRE; Watson Eileen USGR; Weber Aaron USGR; Wendt Rusty USGR; Wichert Rex USGR; Willenbrock Pat USGR; Williams Ron USGR; Wimbush Alexander CHBS; Winch Braydon SGSG; Wojciak Jim USGR; Yates Fred USGR; Yocum Jennifer USGR; Zang Larry USGR

**Subject:** In the News - 8/28/2009

1. **DTN Futures Overview**  
dtnprogressivefarmer.com



# FILED UNDER SEAL

**Atrazine EXPOSED Unsealed by the Court & Exposed by SourceWatch**

2. [US considers tougher restrictions on herbicide atrazine](#)  
ABC.net.au
3. [NYT Terrifies Over "Weed Killers" in Water](#)  
American Council on Science and Health
4. [Soybeans Rise as U.S. Overseas Sales Jump, Cutting Supplies](#)  
Bloomberg
5. [Bedbugs bring exterminators together for a summit in Seattle](#)  
Seattle Times
6. [Hundreds visit local rice research farm for annual tour](#)  
Oroville Mercury-Register (Calif.)
7. [Recycle Your Empty Pesticide Containers Now](#)  
Wallaces Farmer (St. Charles, IL)

## **DTN Futures Overview**

<http://www.dtnprogressivefarmer.com/dtnag/>

[top](#)

---

## **US considers tougher restrictions on herbicide atrazine**

ABC.net.au  
28 August 2009

The herbicide atrazine, widely used on corn, sorghum and sugar, has come under new scrutiny in the United States, and that could have implications for the chemical's future use in America and Australia.

The US is considering the possible new restrictions on Atrazine after a study showed elevated levels of the possible carcinogen in municipal water supplies.

But Sherry Ford, from atrazine maker Syngenta, says the herbicide's been on the market for 50 years now, and is used around the world.

"Australia just recently re-registered the product, as well. It's used in more than 60 countries around the world."

But the EU banned atrazine, and the Natural Resources Defence Council, in its US study, says spiked levels after rains or planting time applications could further endanger human and animal health.

[top](#)

---

## **NYT Terrifies Over "Weed Killers" in Water**

American Council on Science and Health  
22 August 2009

All the news that's fit to scare. That was the thrust of this weekend's New York Times article by Charles Duhigg entitled "Toxic Waters: Debating Just How Much Weed Killer Is Safe in Your Water Glass."

As president of the American Council on Science and Health, I have been following environmental and health media articles for some three decades -- seeing how they measure up in terms of "honors" for exaggerated risk, biased reporting, misrepresented science, and pure sensationalism. The Duhigg article is clearly a contender for the all-time worst.

Duhigg argues that the widespread use of the herbicide atrazine is polluting our supply of drinking water and putting us all -- but particularly pregnant women -- at risk. He consistently refers to "recent studies" (but does not cite them) and concerned "scientists and health advocates" (but does not name any mainstream experts) who think that the Environmental Protection Agency is not protecting us from atrazine -- and that the manufacturers of the herbicide are somehow poisoning us. He cites "new research" showing that atrazine is hazardous even at low levels but does not

# FILED UNDER SEAL

**Atrazine EXPOSED Unsealed by the Court & Exposed by SourceWatch**

specify his sources. He seems oblivious to the work of the most famous early toxicologist (Paracelsus, circa 1500) who set in place the time-honored premise: only the dose makes the poison.

Atrazine is a widely used herbicide -- applied on a variety of crops (corn, sugar cane, sorghum, and more). It is a tightly regulated chemical, and levels in water (where there could be spill-off from agricultural or other applications) are closely monitored by environmental agencies. It has been in safe use for over fifty years. There is a huge "safety factor" built in -- so that permitted trace levels are some hundred-fold less than what could have an adverse effect on human health. The Safe Drinking Water Act requires monitoring water for a multitude of chemicals, including atrazine. You would drown from drinking the huge amounts of water needed for you to be affected by trace levels of atrazine in any American water supply.

Duhigg appears to be playing to the fears (phobias) of consumers who (a) do not know where their food comes from -- and are unaware that without the use of agricultural chemicals like atrazine (which allow farmers to fight weeds, insects and disease) our food supply would be diminished by about half -- and (b) think that even a trace amount of any "chemical" in food, water, air, or consumer products is intolerable. The reality, of course, is that everything, including natural foods, is comprised of chemicals -- most of which are toxic and/or carcinogenic in animals at high dose but are perfectly safe when we consume them.

How much "weed killer" in your water is safe? Well, how much arsenic in your natural baked potato is safe? (Arsenic occurs naturally in potatoes.) The mere ability to detect a chemical in a substance -- in food, air, water, consumer products, or even human tissue -- does not signal that there is a public health hazard.

Nowadays, when we have so many serious public health risks to face (cigarette smoking, obesity, swine flu, and more), Duhigg has given top priority to a bogus risk. And this is irresponsible. As a result of his article, he hopes that Americans will be demanding zero tolerance for atrazine in the water supply -- and we will incur huge expenses to accomplish this dubious goal, with absolutely no resulting health benefits, since there were never any health risks in the first place. Even the Environmental Protection Agency (the most stringent regulatory agency in the world and the most powerful, not known for downplaying chemical risks) stated that atrazine posed no known health risks when they approved re-registration of it in 2006. EPA has evaluated hundreds of studies finding "no evidence of a link to birth defects."

So why did the New York Times give such prominent coverage to a bogus risk? It is part of a general wave of "chemophobia." Earlier this month, the Times accepted a paid advertisement (an "op-ad") on their editorial page, paid for (at a price of about \$50,000) by New York's prestigious Mount Sinai Hospital and Medical Center. The paid-for editorial copy claimed that industrial "chemicals" (phthalates, BPA, etc.) were imperiling our children, when there was no basis whatsoever for such an assertion.

So it is "in" to scare people about "chemicals" in their air, food, water, and consumer products -- and apparently Mr. Duhigg and the Times elected to exploit this phobia. Unfortunately, scaring people about the quality and safety of their drinking water is not only without scientific basis, it is completely counter-productive, distracting us from the real public health hazards we face today.

By Elizabeth M. Whelan, Sc.D., M.P.H., president of the American Council on Science and Health (ACSH.org)

[top](#)

---

## Soybeans Rise as U.S. Overseas Sales Jump, Cutting Supplies

Bloomberg  
28 August 2009

Soybeans rose, set for the first weekly gain in three, after exports from the U.S. expanded, boosting optimism demand growth may be sustained, further tightening global supplies.

Exporters in the U.S., the world's biggest grower and supplier, have sold about 13 million metric tons of soybeans as of Aug. 20 for delivery beginning Sept. 1, up 76 percent from a year earlier, the Department of Agriculture said yesterday. Overseas sales more than tripled to 1.97 million tons in the week ended Aug. 20, from a week earlier, it said.

"Orders like that are helping the oilseed and grain complex," Jonathan Barratt, managing director at Commodity Broking Services Pty in Sydney, said by phone today. "That should extend the gains in the next week."



# FILED UNDER SEAL

**Atrazine EXPOSED Unsealed by the Court & Exposed by SourceWatch**

Soybeans for November delivery, after the U.S. harvest, rallied 1.3 percent to \$10.0925 a bushel in after-hours electronic trading on the Chicago Board of Trade at 2:36 p.m. Singapore time, taking the weekly gain to 3.7 percent, the first in three weeks.

The government lowered its estimate for ending stockpiles in the U.S. to 210 million bushels on Aug. 12, from 250 million bushels a month earlier.

U.S. gross domestic product shrank less than expected, as spending started to climb and profits grew, signaling the world's biggest economy may be recovering from the worst recession since the 1930s.

The economy contracted at an annual pace of 1 percent from April to June, less than the 1.5 percent decline projected by economists in a Bloomberg News survey, according to a Commerce Department report in Washington yesterday.

## Economic Pickup

"The global economy is picking up and that's helping" sustain demand for soybeans, corn and wheat, Commodity Broking's Barratt said. "The dollar weakness is also helping."

Corn for December delivery gained as much as 0.5 percent to \$3.31 a bushel in Chicago, before trading at \$3.3025 at 2:36 p.m. Singapore time. The most-active contract is set for a 1.2 percent advance this week.

December delivery wheat advanced as much as 1 percent to \$5.08 a bushel, before trading at \$5.04 a bushel. The contract is headed for a 3.4 percent weekly rise, the first gain this month.

By Luzi Ann Javier

[top](#)

---

## Bedbugs bring exterminators together for a summit in Seattle

Seattle Times  
27 August 2009

When a problem makes it into a late-night monologue, it's gone mainstream.

From Conan O'Brien on Monday's "Tonight Show": "Former President Clinton recently had to clear out of his office for a few days because it's infested with bedbugs. Experts are calling it the 500th reason President Clinton shouldn't be allowed to have a bed in his office."

Like the joke, the bedbugs suck. But they suck your blood. And their resurgence has prompted experts and exterminators to hold a "Bed Bug Summit" at the Westin Seattle today. Representatives from hotels, hospitals, pest-control companies and the like are encouraged to attend.

Hosted by the National Pest Management Association, it's one of several gatherings sparked by one the Environmental Protection Agency held in April to address the issue, which is preventing a growing number of people from sleeping tight.

"We call them the new flea," said Daniel Valenti, Terminix International's Seattle branch manager. "They're tenacious creatures. They can survive six months without feeding and they're extremely difficult to get rid of."

While nobody seems able to quantify the problem, Valenti said, "Two or three years ago, I'd be lucky to get one bedbug call in a month. Now in my branch alone, I may get two dozen."

## Why bedbugs in 2009?

Bedbugs had virtually disappeared by the '50s and '60s after the advent of DDT and other pesticides, as well as increased cleanliness standards, Washington State University entomology professor Rich Zack explained. But DDT and other pesticides have been banned, and "a lot of the pesticides we developed don't work any longer. The bedbugs have become resistant to them."

# FILED UNDER SEAL

**Atrazine EXPOSED Unsealed by the Court & Exposed by SourceWatch**

Super bedbugs? Not quite. Think natural selection.

Another cause: travel. Some have pointed to the dollar's lower value and the foreign tourists that's drawn. In any case, Zack said, "bedbugs are very easily transported from one area to another. Someone who has an infestation in a dorm, if they take things with them such as suitcases or shoes, there's a very good chance bedbugs will be in that suitcase or their clothing.

"There is a true resurgence going on and it is becoming a significant problem again," Zack said.

The things are essentially little vampires. Roughly the size of a tick, they hide during the day, mainly in mattresses and behind headboards. At night, they come out to feed on you.

Instead of a pair of puncture wounds on the neck, these guys typically leave little red welts on your skin and tiny droplets of dried blood on your sheets — which compounds the rudeness, as those droplets are defecation from your blood, which has passed through them as they left.

The fact that a former president had a bedbug problem shows that the insects are found in all walks of life, said Dr. Dan Suomi, pest-control-operator specialist for the Washington State Department of Agriculture. "This is not a pest that is restricted to any one income class. Anyone can get them because we interact in our travels and day-to-day activities."

Soumi, who'll be speaking at today's summit, said they've been seen "more in hotels and motels on the West Coast. But that's not an issue hoteliers want to discuss."

For obvious reasons. Olympia-based Eden Advanced Pest Technologies said bedbugs are "causing major issues for the hospitality industry." But also: "Airline pilots, people in movie theaters, owners of nursing homes, day-care centers, anywhere people congregate there could be a bedbug infestation."

No need to sleep sitting up yet, though. Here's what to do if you think you've got 'em:

First, research.

"Don't overreact, Soumi said. "Don't grab the first can of pesticide or set off 10 bug bombs inside your house because that's not going to work."

If you call an exterminator — or "commercial applicator" in the business of applying pesticides — make sure it's someone licensed with the Dept. of Agriculture. You can look them up here: <http://agr.wa.gov/PestFert/LicensingEd/Search/>

As someone in the business of profiting from the problem, even Seattle Terminix commercial-branch service manager Troy Kleghorn advised against getting drained: "Get at least three bids, same as you would a car repair. Don't settle for just one person." Estimates, he said, should be free.

The job can run several hundred dollars and typically involves taking the bedroom apart to inspect every nook and cranny — as well as a follow-up visit.

"Even for us it's tough," Kleghorn said.

By Mark Rahner

[top](#)

---

## Hundreds visit local rice research farm for annual tour

Oroville Mercury-Register (Calif.)  
26 August 2009



# FILED UNDER SEAL

**Atrazine EXPOSED Unsealed by the Court & Exposed by SourceWatch**

BIGGS -- Fields at the Rice Experiment Station were filled with approximately 300 rice growers and members of the rice industry Wednesday morning, when the California Cooperative Rice Research Foundation and University of California hosted their annual Rice Field Day.

With thousands of acres of rice fields awaiting fall harvest, the majority of the rice industry's leaders gathered Wednesday to learn about the new developments in managing and growing rice as well as to honor one of their own.

The event commenced with the research foundation's annual meeting, where William Huffman was awarded the California Rice Industry Award.

Huffman, who grew up on his family's rice farm in Gridley, has spent more than 25 years with Farmer's Rice Cooperative, serving as director of communications, vice president of communications, and currently as the part-time director of government affairs.

Huffman, who graduated from Humboldt State with a degree in journalism, said the accolade was a surprise to him, adding that years ago, he covered the field day as a reporter for a radio station out of Sacramento.

"I first came to this station as a young reporter and here we are 41 years later," Huffman said.

Following the award presentation and meeting, attendees loaded up into trucks and buses, with participants touring the rice research fields and greenhouses.

One stop on the tour was at entomologist Larry Godfrey's field, where the UC Davis extension researcher conducted pesticide trials on varieties of rice.

Godfrey said 2009 saw a large rise in the number of rice water weevils at the station, with staff collecting 6,100 small beetles from their research field between March and June. In 2008, 2,311 weevils were collected during the same time period, with Godfrey noting the considerable increase.

"We've had low numbers since 2001, but this year was higher," Godfrey said, adding that in the 1970s anywhere from 30,000-40,000 weevils were collected at the station. "We're down historically, but compared to recent years, this is a high year."

Godfrey said the weevils often find rice fields an enjoyable habitat, and while the insect appreciates the rice, farmers aren't so keen on the pest, which can dramatically reduce rice yields.

To combat the weevils, Godfrey tested a variety of pesticides this past year, some of which are currently experimental and unavailable to growers.

Although Godfrey said only about 25 percent of the rice in California is treated with pesticides, Godfrey said he still strives to find the most effective chemical for growers, with a continued focus on the environment.

"I like to provide information to growers that help them to make the decision as to whether to use treatments or not," Godfrey said. "Of course we are always looking towards using those that are less toxic and more environmentally friendly."

Godfrey said his research showed that three pesticides, Warrior, Mustang and Dimilin, worked comparably, adding that experimental treatment V10170, "worked just as well" as the registered pesticides.

Still, even with the success of the pesticides, Godfrey said local growers may see a reduction in their rice yields this year due to the weevil.

Aside from the pesticide research, the Rice Experiment Station also welcomed some new additions this past year, with the 97-year-old facility now housing a new DNA lab and refrigerated greenhouses.

George Yeltatzie, lab technician, said the old DNA lab was combined with the station's other labs, with the facility often crowded and noisy.

The new lab, which is home to the large machines used to identify certain rice characteristics, is now near the greenhouses, with Yeltatzie saying the move should ultimately benefit the growers.

# FILED UNDER SEAL

**Atrazine EXPOSED Unsealed by the Court & Exposed by SourceWatch**

"We help breeders to develop new strains of rice, by identifying certain characteristics in the rice that are desirable," Yeltatzie said. "With this lab, we can work a lot faster, and hopefully help develop new rice strains more quickly."

The greenhouses will also help with the development of heartier rice, Station Director Kent McKenzie said, adding that the \$900,000 renovation will better help researchers to search and select varieties of rice that are more cold tolerant.

With rice temperamental to cooler temperatures, McKenzie said researchers are continually focused on developing rice varieties that can withstand the colder weather, a feat that wasn't as easy with air-conditioned greenhouses.

The refrigerated greenhouses will better allow researchers to control the temperature inside the structure with the renovation doubling the rice screening capacity.

All of the new construction and innovations at the station this past year are something Richvale rice farmer Curt Bohannon said he appreciates.

Bohannon, like other California rice farmers, pays an assessment on his rice every year to fund the center, and as he stood in the new DNA lab, he said the work of the station is what keeps rice growers in the United States competitive.

"These guys are on the cutting edge of technology," Bohannon said. "I think it pays off. The varieties of rice have dramatically changed since my family first started farming. They help us stay relatively strong as an industry."

By Toni Scott - Staff Writer

[top](#)

---

## Recycle Your Empty Pesticide Containers Now

Wallaces Farmer (St. Charles, IL)  
28 August 2009

If you still have empty pesticide containers sitting around, there are convenient recycling options you can use to get rid of them.

Don't let empty pesticide containers sit around. There are convenient recycling options available in Iowa which you can use to get rid of them and actually put them to good use. These options are making a difference in the volume of pesticide containers burned or disposed of in sanitary landfills. That volume is being reduced, thanks to recycling efforts by farmers and dealers.

"Pesticides play an integral role in Iowa crop production, but their use means there are many pesticide containers to manage," says Kristine Schaefer, a pesticide education specialist with Iowa State University Extension. Without proper cleaning and disposal, discarded containers risk adding needless bulk to landfills or becoming human and environmental health hazards. Fortunately, convenient pesticide container recycling options are available in Iowa."

Program recycles approved plastic containers at no charge

In 2008 Container Services Network LLC was awarded a three-year contract from the Ag Container Recycling Council to coordinate Iowa's pesticide container recycling program. As part of the program, CSN recycles all approved plastic crop protection containers up to 55 gallons at no charge.

Participants receive free large tote bags to store their clean, triple- or pressure-rinsed containers until pickup. Each bag holds about 60 pounds of pesticide containers. Containers that are five gallons or less must be put in bags while those over five gallons will be loaded loose onto the truck. Properly rinsed mini-bulk containers that have been cut into 2-foot-wide strips will also be collected.

CSN then coordinates with each agribusiness organization and collection point to schedule pickups. To schedule a pickup, call CSN at (866) 225-6629. The CSN Web site has more information about CSN and its services.

Some DNR landfills and recycling centers take them too



# FILED UNDER SEAL

## **Atrazine EXPOSED Unsealed by the Court & Exposed by SourceWatch**

Several Iowa DNR landfills or recycling centers also accept clean, properly rinsed pesticide containers for recycling, she says. Containers must be triple-rinsed and have a hole punched in the bottom to indicate they have been emptied and rinsed. For more information on the program, participating Iowa DNR sites and procedures for triple- or pressure-rinsing containers, see the ISU Extension publication on Pesticide Container Recycling.

"Since 1990, Iowa pesticide users have recycled more than 5 million pounds of plastic pesticide containers by participating in a pesticide container recycling program. The recycling program has reduced the volume of pesticide containers that are burned or disposed in sanitary landfills, and enhanced the recovery of plastic resources," says Schaefer.

By Compiled by staff

[top](#)

**FILED UNDER SEAL**  
**Atrazine EXPOSED Unsealed by the Court & Exposed by SourceWatch**

---

**From:** Carroll Beth USGR  
**Sent:** Friday, August 28, 2009 1:22 PM  
**To:** Gilbert Ross; Pastoor Tim USGR; Goldsmith Steven USGR; Ford Sherry USGR; Nadel Alan USGR  
**Subject:** RE: ACSH proposal, "Pesticides and Health"

Hi Gil,  
We are not able to open your file. Can you send it in Word?  
Thanks  
Beth

---

**From:** Gilbert Ross [mailto:rossg@acsh.org]  
**Sent:** Friday, August 28, 2009 1:36 PM  
**To:** Carroll Beth USGR; Pastoor Tim USGR; Goldsmith Steven USGR; Ford Sherry USGR; Nadel Alan USGR  
**Subject:** ACSH proposal, "Pesticides and Health"

Dear Syngenta friends,

We enjoyed the opportunity to speak with all of you yesterday afternoon.  
It is our mission to continue to be at the forefront of defending the scientific facts as they relate to atrazine and other pesticides/ag. chemicals.

As we made clear, ACSH is eager to commission a literature review on the general subject of pesticide exposure and human health. The paper would, of course, not be exclusively about atrazine, but the recent and ongoing "controversy" would be a primary focus. Like all of our reports, the paper would be peer reviewed in-house by perhaps 5 or more of our own scientific experts; we will then send the paper to an outside peer review journal.

Journals where ACSH literature reviews have been published recently include:

*Ecotoxicology and Environmental Safety*  
*International Journal of Toxicology*  
*Medscape*  
*Environmental Health Perspectives*  
*Journal of Pharmaceutical Finance, Economics, and Policy*  
*Comprehensive Reviews in Food Science and Food Safety*  
*Regulatory Toxicology and Pharmacology*  
*Technology*  
*Food and Drug Law Journal*

At the same time, we will "consumerize" this academic paper into a short consumer-friendly booklet, available for free download from our webpage. We may also redact it further into a color brochure, "What's the Story?" type pamphlet. We will widely distribute the report to the media, and use it as the basis for Op-eds, letters to the editor, media appearances etc. The work will be featured on our websites--including [www.healthfactsandfears.com](http://www.healthfactsandfears.com), which, as you know, is a Google news source. In the course of this project, we would bring our 400 scientists up to date on the subject.

Our budget for a project of this size is \$100,000.

This is separate and distinct from general operating support *Syngenta* has been so generously providing over the years, which we request to continue at current or increased levels. Such general operating support is the lifeblood of a small non-profit like ours, and is both deeply appreciated and much needed.

# FILED UNDER SEAL

**Atrazine EXPOSED Unsealed by the Court & Exposed by SourceWatch**

Thank you for your consideration. We are looking forward to tackling this crucially important subject in the thorough and scientifically accurate manner characteristic of ACSH's work over the past 32 years.

Beth, Gil, and Jeff

ps--Please contact me with any questions or concerns. I am attaching a synopsis of our usual research, publication and media outreach techniques:

# FILED UNDER SEAL

**Atrazine** EXPOSED Unsealed by the Court & Exposed by SourceWatch

**From:** Gilbert Ross [rossg@acsh.org]  
**Sent:** Monday, October 19, 2009 2:43 PM  
**To:** Elizabeth Whelan; Goldsmith Steven USGR  
**Cc:** Jeff Stier; Carroll Beth USGR; Pastoor Tim USGR  
**Subject:** NPR "Fresh Air" [yeah right] posting by "Beth Whelan"  
**Attachments:** no-user-image.gif

NOTE: my-- how hard it is to restrict myself to 1250 "spaces" on such critically important topics! Gil



**Elizabeth Whelan (BethWhelan)** wrote:

Mr. Duhigg's articles are replete with exaggerated risk, bias, misrepresented science and sensationalism. He argues that the use of various "pollutants" with decades-long histories of safe use (e.g. atrazine) is putting us at risk. He is apparently unaware of the fact that minute levels of substances in our water do not pose a health threat. No American of any age has been harmed by trace levels of chemicals. Duhigg is playing to the fears of consumers who are unaware that without the use of agricultural chemicals our food supply would be diminished by half. The reality is that food is comprised of chemicals-many of which are toxic in animals at high dose but are safe when we consume them. Now the EPA, which stood behind its own studies confirming the safety of these chemicals, is going on a crusade which will waste more taxpayer millions seeking solutions to non-problems. We have so many serious health risks, yet you have given top priority to bogus risks. "Chemophobia" is in: scaring people about chemicals in our food, water, and consumer products gets attention—but it is counterproductive, distracting us from the real public health hazards we face today. Dr.E.Whelan acsh.org American Council on Science and Health, NYC  
October 19, 2009 3:40:05 PM EDT

Gilbert Ross M.D.  
Medical Director  
The American Council on Science and Health  
1995 Broadway  
New York NY 10023  
212-362-7044 x242  
cell 516-581-8400  
[rossg@acsh.org](mailto:rossg@acsh.org)  
fax 212-362-4919  
Please visit [www.acsh.org](http://www.acsh.org) and [www.healthfactsandfears.com](http://www.healthfactsandfears.com)



**FILED UNDER SEAL**  
**Atrazine EXPOSED Unsealed by the Court & Exposed by SourceWatch**

---

**From:** Carroll Beth USGR  
**Sent:** Wednesday, December 02, 2009 12:57 PM  
**To:** Goldsmith Steven USGR  
**Cc:** Jeff Stier; Gilbert Ross; Ford Sherry USGR; Nadel Alan USGR  
**Subject:** RE: Query about possible author combo for "Ag-chem. and Health" paper

Steve,  
Here's the Wiki question reply from ACSH. Would you like to discuss with Gil Ross & Jeff Stier?  
Thanks  
Beth

---

**From:** Gilbert Ross [mailto:rossg@acsh.org]  
**Sent:** Wednesday, December 02, 2009 1:53 PM  
**To:** Carroll Beth USGR  
**Cc:** Jeff Stier  
**Subject:** Re: Query about possible author combo for "Ag-chem. and Health" paper

Beth--

I forgot this part of your email.  
Coincidentally, we are likely soon to launch a "Wiki Watchdog" program regarding the plastic chemical BPA.  
We were recruited to undertake this endeavor by a pr firm working with a consortium of plastics industry folks.  
If all goes according to plan, we will hire an intern with some sci/tox expertise, and with a sound knowledge of "social networking" techniques and Wiki updates, to monitor that site and make science-based modifications as needed. Of course, we here at ACSH, in consultation with BPA experts outside, would make those decisions.

I wonder if we could work something out between us as well on atrazine/wiki disinformation?

Gil

On Dec 1, 2009, at 2:58 PM, <[beth.carroll@syngenta.com](mailto:beth.carroll@syngenta.com)> <[beth.carroll@syngenta.com](mailto:beth.carroll@syngenta.com)> wrote:

**Additionally, we are looking for a university scientist (if possible) that would be willing to keep the atrazine page on Wikipedia updated.....of course anyone can edit it so there is some erroneous information on it currently. If you have any ideas on that it would be great.**

Gilbert Ross M.D.  
Medical Director  
The American Council on Science and Health

# FILED UNDER SEAL

**Atrazine EXPOSED** Unsealed by the Court & Exposed by SourceWatch

1995 Broadway  
New York NY 10023  
212-362-7044 x242  
cell 516-581-8400

[rossg@acsh.org](mailto:rossg@acsh.org)

fax 212-362-4919

Please visit [www.acsh.org](http://www.acsh.org) and [www.healthfactsandfcars.com](http://www.healthfactsandfcars.com)



# FILED UNDER SEAL

**Atrazine EXPOSED** Unsealed by the Court & Exposed by SourceWatch

---

**From:** Drake Dora (ext) USGR  
**Sent:** Friday, February 26, 2010 12:37 PM  
**To:** Carroll Beth USGR  
**Subject:** RE: Please print these documents for Janis - she will come by and pick them up

Done - should I put these on the teamspace?

---

**From:** Carroll Beth USGR  
**Sent:** Friday, February 26, 2010 1:28 PM  
**To:** Drake Dora (ext) USGR  
**Subject:** Please print these documents for Janis - she will come by and pick them up

---

**From:** Carroll Beth USGR  
**Sent:** Friday, February 26, 2010 10:43 AM  
**To:** 'Gilbert Ross'; Jeff Stier; Elizabeth Whelan  
**Cc:** Goldsmith Steven USGR; Pastoor Tim USGR  
**Subject:** New Hayes study

Hi Gil and all,

Attached are: 1) our quick synopsis of the study (Document 7), 2) the Hayes paper, 3) the Hayes paper supplemental information, 4) testimony from Anne Lindsay, EPA (retired) on EPA's evaluation of the earlier Hayes studies. I am hoping that you all have someone in your list of scientists that is an ecotox person who could assist in the media inquiries we are receiving.

Thanks  
Beth

*N. Beth Carroll, Ph.D.  
Sr. Stewardship Manager  
Syngenta Crop Protection, Inc.  
P. O. Box 18300  
Greensboro, NC 27419-8300  
Phone: (336) 632-7178  
Mobile: (336) 549-4353  
Fax: (336) 632-7065  
email: [beth.carroll@syngenta.com](mailto:beth.carroll@syngenta.com)*

**If you desire peace, cultivate justice, but at the same time cultivate the fields to produce more bread; otherwise there will be no peace.**

**--Norman E. Borlaug**

This e-mail, including any attachments, may include confidential and/or proprietary information, and may be used only by the person or entity to which it is addressed. If the reader of this e-mail is not the intended recipient or his or her authorized agent, the reader is hereby notified that any dissemination, distribution or copying of this e-mail is prohibited. If you have received this e-mail in error, please notify the sender by replying to this message and delete this e-mail immediately. Thank you.

**FILED UNDER SEAL**  
**Atrazine EXPOSED Unsealed by the Court & Exposed by SourceWatch**

---

**From:** Goldsmith Steven USGR  
**Sent:** Monday, October 19, 2009 1:01 PM  
**To:** Pastoor Tim USGR; 'mikeb@quinnthomas.com'  
**Cc:** 'edoherty@whwg.com'; 'joshgilder@aol.com'; 'doug@quinnthomas.com'; Ford Sherry USGR; Nadel Alan USGR  
**Subject:** RE: ATTY/CLIENT PRIVILEGED: Duhigg appearing on NPR's Fresh Air today

I just called Dr. Ross, as Dr. Whelan was out of the office. Gil is going to help.  
Steve

---

**From:** Pastoor Tim USGR  
**Sent:** Monday, October 19, 2009 1:38 PM  
**To:** Goldsmith Steven USGR; 'mikeb@quinnthomas.com'  
**Cc:** 'edoherty@whwg.com'; 'joshgilder@aol.com'; 'doug@quinnthomas.com'; Ford Sherry USGR; Nadel Alan USGR  
**Subject:** Re: ATTY/CLIENT PRIVILEGED: Duhigg appearing on NPR's Fresh Air today

Steve : will you be contacting Elizabeth?

---

**From:** Goldsmith Steven USGR  
**To:** Mike Burita  
**Cc:** Eileen Doherty ; Josh Gilder ; Doug Badger ; Ford Sherry USGR; Nadel Alan USGR; Pastoor Tim USGR  
**Sent:** Mon Oct 19 13:06:25 2009  
**Subject:** RE: ATTY/CLIENT PRIVILEGED: Duhigg appearing on NPR's Fresh Air today  
Should we get Elizabeth to post her commentary about Duhigg's story on the Fresh Air website?  
Steve

---

**From:** Mike Burita [mailto:mikeb@quinnthomas.com]  
**Sent:** Monday, October 19, 2009 12:56 PM  
**To:** Goldsmith Steven USGR  
**Cc:** Eileen Doherty; Josh Gilder; Doug Badger  
**Subject:** Re: ATTY/CLIENT PRIVILEGED: Duhigg appearing on NPR's Fresh Air today

Hi Steve – I just left you a voicemail. It might be worth a non-confrontational call or email into the producers of the show from either you or Elizabeth ahead of the story to make them aware of Duhigg's misreporting of many of the facts on atrazine and his refusal to correct the record. Likely a long shot, but they might at least mention that the facts of his reporting have been disputed by some, they could always tag it onto the end of the pre-record. Or better they might grant us some degree of equal time later.

Just a thought, anyone else agree?

I'll pull the producer contact info just in case.

Just FYI here's the updated link: <http://www.npr.org/templates/story/story.php?storyId=113927993>

Regardless, we need to prep some rapid responses to post online immediately after the show airs.

1

CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION - SUBJECT TO PROTECTIVE  
ORDER IN ATRAZINE LITIGATION

SYN04751299



# FILED UNDER SEAL

**Atrazine EXPOSED Unsealed by the Court & Exposed by SourceWatch**

Mike

On 10/19/09 12:39 PM, "steven.goldsmith@syngenta.com" <steven.goldsmith@syngenta.com> wrote:

**From:** Goldsmith Steven USGR  
**Sent:** Monday, October 19, 2009 12:39 PM  
**To:** 'Eileen Doherty'; Ford Sherry USGR; Josh Gilder; Pastoor Tim USGR; Nadel Alan USGR  
**Subject:** RE: ATTY/CLIENT PRIVILEGED: Duhigg appearing on NPR's Fresh Air today

In talking with Eileen and Josh, we talked about perhaps offering Elizabeth Whalen to the show, but it appears from their website as if it's already been recorded. It will be posted on their website at 3 p.m. and I assume will go to air after that.

Duhigg posted this on his Twitter page: I'm on Fresh Air today talking about water (in case you breathe, drink or feel unrefresh.)

<http://www.npr.org/templates/story/story.php?storyId=113927993>

*October 19, 2009*

An estimated one in 10 Americans have been exposed to drinking water that contains dangerous chemicals, parasites, bacteria or viruses, or fails to meet federal health standards. Part of the problem, says journalist Charles Duhigg, is that water-pollution laws are not being enforced.

Duhigg reports on the "worsening pollution in American waters" — and regulators' responses to the problem — in his *New York Times* series, "Toxic Waters" <<http://projects.nytimes.com/toxic-waters>> . In researching the series, he studied thousands of water pollution records, which he obtained via the Freedom of Information Act.

Duhigg previously wrote about businesses' and investors' efforts to profit from the growing number of older Americans in his "Golden Opportunities" <[http://topics.nytimes.com/topics/news/business/series/golden\\_opportunities/index.html](http://topics.nytimes.com/topics/news/business/series/golden_opportunities/index.html)> " series for the *Times*. He is a regular contributor on NPR's Planet Money Blog. <<http://www.npr.org/blogs/money/>>

**From:** Eileen Doherty [<mailto:edoherty@whwg.com>]  
**Sent:** Monday, October 19, 2009 11:28 AM  
**To:** Goldsmith Steven USGR; Ford Sherry USGR; Josh Gilder; Pastoor Tim USGR; Nadel Alan USGR  
**Subject:** Re: ATTY/CLIENT PRIVILEGED: Duhigg appearing on NPR's Fresh Air today

I think we should, if only to say that we have sent Duhigg corrections that he would not use. Can we chat when Josh returns after noon?

Eileen

All -- Tim heard about this. Should we send something to Terry Gross today?  
Steve

**Coming Up Oct. 19:** An estimated one in 10 Americans has been exposed to drinking water that contains dangerous chemicals or fails to meet federal health standards. We'll hear from journalist Charles Duhigg about his *New York Times* series *Toxic Waters*.

<http://www.npr.org/templates/story/story.php?storyId=13>

# FILED UNDER SEAL

**Atrazine** **EXPOSED** Unsealed by the Court & Exposed by SourceWatch

*This message may contain confidential information. If you are not the designated recipient, please notify the sender immediately, and delete the original and any copies. Any use of the message by you is prohibited.*

---

*This message may contain confidential information. If you are not the designated recipient, please notify the sender immediately, and delete the original and any copies. Any use of the message by you is prohibited.*

# FILED UNDER SEAL

**Atrazine EXPOSED** Unsealed by the Court & Exposed by SourceWatch

--  
**From:** Mike Burita [mikeb@quinnthomas.com]  
**Sent:** Monday, October 19, 2009 12:13 PM  
**To:** Goldsmith Steven USGR  
**Cc:** Eileen Doherty; joshgilder@aol.com; doug@quinnthomas.com; Ford Sherry USGR; Nadel Alan USGR; Pastoor Tim USGR  
**Subject:** Re: ATTY/CLIENT PRIVILEGED: Duhigg appearing on NPR's Fresh Air today

I'd suggest that she pull key points refuting anything specific that he says on air and then provide a link to her commentary if its available online.

Mike

On 10/19/09 1:06 PM, "steven.goldsmith@syngenta.com" <steven.goldsmith@syngenta.com> wrote:

Should we get Elizabeth to post her commentary about Duhigg's story on the Fresh Air website?  
Steve

**From:** Mike Burita [mailto:mikeb@quinnthomas.com]  
**Sent:** Monday, October 19, 2009 12:56 PM  
**To:** Goldsmith Steven USGR  
**Cc:** Eileen Doherty; Josh Gilder; Doug Badger  
**Subject:** Re: ATTY/CLIENT PRIVILEGED: Duhigg appearing on NPR's Fresh Air today

Hi Steve – I just left you a voicemail. It might be worth a non-confrontational call or email into the producers of the show from either you or Elizabeth ahead of the story to make them aware of Duhigg's misreporting of many of the facts on atrazine and his refusal to correct the record. Likely a long shot, but they might at least mention that the facts of his reporting have been disputed by some, they could always tag it onto the end of the pre-record. Or better they might grant us some degree of equal time later.

Just a thought, anyone else agree?

I'll pull the producer contact info just in case.

Just FYI here's the updated link: <http://www.npr.org/templates/story/story.php?storyId=113927993>

Regardless, we need to prep some rapid responses to post online immediately after the show airs.

Mike

On 10/19/09 12:39 PM, "steven.goldsmith@syngenta.com" <steven.goldsmith@syngenta.com> wrote:

**From:** Goldsmith Steven USGR  
**Sent:** Monday, October 19, 2009 12:39 PM  
**To:** 'Eileen Doherty'; Ford Sherry USGR; Josh Gilder; Pastoor Tim USGR; Nadel Alan USGR  
**Subject:** RE: ATTY/CLIENT PRIVILEGED: Duhigg appearing on NPR's Fresh Air today



# FILED UNDER SEAL

In talking with Eileen and Josh, we talked about perhaps offering Elizabeth Whelan to the show, but it appears from their website as if it's already been recorded. It will be posted on their website at 3 p.m. and I assume will go to air after that.

Duhigg posted this on his Twitter page: I'm on Fresh Air today talking about water (in case you breathe, drink or feel unfresh.)

<http://www.npr.org/templates/story/story.php?storyId=113927993>

October 19, 2009

An estimated one in 10 Americans have been exposed to drinking water that contains dangerous chemicals, parasites, bacteria or viruses, or fails to meet federal health standards. Part of the problem, says journalist Charles Duhigg, is that water-pollution laws are not being enforced.

Duhigg reports on the "worsening pollution in American waters" — and regulators' responses to the problem — in his *New York Times* series, "Toxic Waters" <<http://projects.nytimes.com/toxic-waters>> . In researching the series, he studied thousands of water pollution records, which he obtained via the Freedom of Information Act.

Duhigg previously wrote about businesses' and investors' efforts to profit from the growing number of older Americans in his "Golden Opportunities" <[http://topics.nytimes.com/topics/news/business/series/golden\\_opportunities/index.html](http://topics.nytimes.com/topics/news/business/series/golden_opportunities/index.html)> " series for the *Times*. He is a regular contributor on NPR's Planet Money Blog. <<http://www.npr.org/blogs/money/>>

**From:** Eileen Doherty (<mailto:edoherty@whwg.com>)

**Sent:** Monday, October 19, 2009 11:28 AM

**To:** Goldsmith Steven USGR; Ford Sherry USGR; Josh Gilder; Pastoor Tim USGR; Nadel Alan USGR

**Subject:** Re: ATTY/CLIENT PRIVILEGED: Duhigg appearing on NPR's Fresh Air today

I think we should, if only to say that we have sent Duhigg corrections that he would not use. Can we chat when Josh returns after noon?

Eileen

All -- Tim heard about this. Should we send something to Terry Gross today?

Steve

**Coming Up Oct. 19:** An estimated one in 10 Americans has been exposed to drinking water that contains dangerous chemicals or fails to meet federal health standards. We'll hear from journalist Charles Duhigg about his *New York Times* series *Toxic Waters*.

<http://www.npr.org/templates/story/story.php?storyId=13>

*This message may contain confidential information. If you are not the designated recipient, please notify the sender immediately, and delete the original and any copies. Any use of the message by you is prohibited.*

# FILED UNDER SEAL

**Atrazine EXPOSED Unsealed by the Court & Exposed by SourceWatch**

*This message may contain confidential information. If you are not the designated recipient, please notify the sender immediately, and delete the original and any copies. Any use of the message by you is prohibited.*

---

*This message may contain confidential information. If you are not the designated recipient, please notify the sender immediately, and delete the original and any copies. Any use of the message by you is prohibited.*

**FILED UNDER SEAL**  
**Atrazine EXPOSED Unsealed by the Court & Exposed by SourceWatch**

---

**From:** Gilbert Ross [rossg@acsh.org]  
**Sent:** Friday, August 28, 2009 12:36 PM  
**To:** Carroll Beth USGR; Pastoor Tim USGR; Goldsmith Steven USGR; Ford Sherry USGR; Nadel Alan USGR  
**Subject:** ACSH proposal, "Pesticides and Health"  
**Attachments:** ACSH ProjectTechniques; ATT00001.htm

Dear Syngenta friends,

We enjoyed the opportunity to speak with all of you yesterday afternoon. It is our mission to continue to be at the forefront of defending the scientific facts as they relate to atrazine and other pesticides/ag. chemicals.

As we made clear, ACSH is eager to commission a literature review on the general subject of pesticide exposure and human health. The paper would, of course, not be exclusively about atrazine, but the recent and ongoing "controversy" would be a primary focus. Like all of our reports, the paper would be peer reviewed in-house by perhaps 5 or more of our own scientific experts; we will then send the paper to an outside peer review journal.

Journals where ACSH literature reviews have been published recently include:

*Ecotoxicology and Environmental Safety*  
*International Journal of Toxicology*  
*Medscape*  
*Environmental Health Perspectives*  
*Journal of Pharmaceutical Finance, Economics, and Policy*  
*Comprehensive Reviews in Food Science and Food Safety*  
*Regulatory Toxicology and Pharmacology*  
*Technology*  
*Food and Drug Law Journal*

At the same time, we will "consumerize" this academic paper into a short consumer-friendly booklet, available for free download from our webpage. We may also redact it further into a color brochure, "What's the Story?" type pamphlet. We will widely distribute the report to the media, and use it as the basis for Op-eds, letters to the editor, media appearances etc. The work will be featured on our websites--including [www.healthfactsandfears.com](http://www.healthfactsandfears.com), which, as you know, is a Google news source. In the course of this project, we would bring our 400 scientists up to date on the subject.

Our budget for a project of this size is \$100,000.

This is separate and distinct from general operating support *Syngenta* has been so generously providing over the years, which we request to continue at current or increased levels. Such general operating support is the lifeblood of a small non-profit like ours, and is both deeply appreciated and much needed.

Thank you for your consideration. We are looking forward to tackling this crucially important subject in the thorough and scientifically accurate manner characteristic of ACSH's work over the past 32 years.

Beth, Gil, and Jeff

ps--Please contact me with any questions or concerns. I am attaching a synopsis of our usual research, publication and media outreach techniques:



**FILED UNDER SEAL**  
**Atrazine EXPOSED Unsealed by the Court & Exposed by SourceWatch**

--  

---

**From:** Elizabeth Whelan [whelane@acsh.org]  
**Sent:** Wednesday, September 09, 2009 10:18 AM  
**To:** Pastoor Tim USGR  
**Cc:** Carroll Beth USGR; Gil Ross; Jeff Stier  
**Subject:** update on ACSH pesticide/ atrazine project?

Hi, Tim and Beth,

Has there been any progress regarding advancing the ACSH project on atrazine and pesticide safety generally?  
We are eager to get it underway.

Thanks so much. Look forward to hearing from you.

Beth

Dr. Elizabeth M. Whelan  
President  
American Council on Science and Health  
1995 Broadway 2nd Floor  
New York 10023  
212 362 7044; fax 212 362 4919  
cell 917 439 8043

[Whelan@ACSH.org](mailto:Whelan@ACSH.org)  
please visit [www.acsh.org](http://www.acsh.org) and [www.healthfactsandfears.com](http://www.healthfactsandfears.com)

**FILED UNDER SEAL**  
**Atrazine EXPOSED Unsealed by the Court & Exposed by SourceWatch**

---

**From:** Gilbert Ross [rossg@acsh.org]  
**Sent:** Monday, September 21, 2009 2:59 PM  
**To:** Carrol Beth USGR  
**Cc:** Elizabeth Whelan  
**Subject:** ACSH proposal and invoice, "Ag Chemicals..."  
**Attachments:** Syngenta Invoice 91909.pdf; ATT00001.htm

Also by Fedex-

---

*N. Beth Carroll, Ph.D.*

*Sr. Stewardship Manager*

*Syngenta Crop Protection, Inc.*

*P. O. Box 18300*

*Greensboro, NC 27419-8300*

**September 21, 2009**

Dear Beth: [Dr. Carroll]

We enjoyed the opportunity to speak with all of you recently, and are quite eager to begin the project we discussed:

*Agricultural Chemicals and Health:*

**Myths vs. Realities**

It is our mission to continue to be at the forefront of defending the scientific facts as they relate to atrazine and other agricultural chemicals, including herbicides and pesticides.

As we made clear, ACSH is eager to commission a literature review on the general subject of such exposures and human health. The paper would, of course, not be exclusively about atrazine, but the recent and ongoing "controversy" would be a primary focus. The American public, having been inundated with allusions to pesticide toxicity over the years, based on little or no science, stands to gain much insight by our educational outreach, communicated by an independent public health non-profit—to get not only the activist-media viewpoint, but the scientific data, especially highlighting the vast **benefits** of these chemicals, largely ignored in the press and by the public.

# FILED UNDER SEAL

Like all of our reports, the paper would be peer reviewed in-house by 3 or more of our own scientific experts, we will then send the paper to an outside peer review journal.

Journals where ACSH literature reviews have been published recently include:

*Ecotoxicology and Environmental Safety*

*International Journal of Toxicology*

*Medscape*

*Environmental Health Perspectives*

*Journal of Pharmaceutical Finance, Economics, and Policy*

*Comprehensive Reviews in Food Science and Food Safety*

*Regulatory Toxicology and Pharmacology*

*Technology*

*Food and Drug Law Journal*

At the same time, we will "consumerize" this academic paper into a short consumer-friendly booklet, available for free download from our webpage. We may also redact it further into a color brochure, "What's the Story?" type pamphlet. We will widely distribute the report to the media, and use it as the basis for Op-eds, letters to the editor, media appearances etc. The work will be featured on our websites--including [www.healthfactsandfears.com](http://www.healthfactsandfears.com), which, as you know, is a Google news source. In the course of this project, we would bring our 400 scientists up to date on the subject.

**Our budget for a project of this size is \$100,000.**

This amount is separate and distinct from general operating support *Syngenta* has been so generously providing over the years, which we request to continue at current or increased levels. Such general operating support is the lifeblood of a small non-profit like ours, and is both deeply appreciated and much needed.

Thank you for your consideration. We are looking forward to tackling this crucially important subject in the thorough and scientifically accurate manner characteristic of ACSH's work over the past 32 years.

Dr. Elizabeth Whelan (Beth)  
President



# FILED UNDER SEAL

**Atrazine EXPOSED** Unsealed by the Court & Exposed by SourceWatch  
Gilbert Ross, M.D. (GI)  
Executive and Medical Director

The American Council on Science and Health  
New York