

FILED UNDER SEAL

Atrazine **EXPOSED** Unsealed by the Court & Exposed by SourceWatch

EXHIBIT 14

*Steven Milloy documents with beginning Bates numbers
SYN04530687, SYN04564315, SYN00763640, SYN00763556,
SYN03470891, SYN03470895, SYN04530689, SYN03029695,
SYN03470889, SYN02827026, SYN04568464, and
SYN04566039*

FILED UNDER SEAL

Atrazine EXPOSED Unsealed by the Court & Exposed by SourceWatch

Atrazine Communications Strategy

December 2002 through February 2003

DRAFT 12.6.02

Situation

- NRDC successfully negotiated the delay of the Interim Re-registration Eligibility Decision on atrazine from August 3, 2002, to January 31, 2003. While this action does not impact the current use of the product in the US, NRDC views it as a victory. It essentially forces Syngenta to expend additional time and money to defend atrazine until a re-registration decision is made. EPA will accept comments and additional data on amphibians through February 28. We expect an EPA Scientific Advisory Panel meeting to be held on frogs in late spring/early summer 2003, followed by a final decision from EPA on the frog issue by year-end 2003.
- Tyrone Hayes, a professor at University of California, Berkeley, and a former member of the Atrazine Ecological Risk Assessment Panel, published a study regarding the effects of atrazine exposure on *Rana pipiens* frogs in *Nature* on October 31, 2002. A longer, online version of the study was posted October 23 on the *Environmental Health Perspectives* website. These articles spawned another flurry of media coverage in the regulatory, trade and consumer media.
- We fully expect another Hayes study to be published before the end of EPA's "comment period" on frogs (February 28). This one is rumored to involve atrazine's effect on the development of frogs in the lab and field in synergy with Syngenta's S-metolachlor herbicide. Atrazine and S-metolachlor are the two key active ingredients in the popular Syngenta Bicep MAGNUM® corn herbicides.
- Funded and promoted largely by activist groups, Hayes has been out front on the atrazine/frog issue in the media, forcing us to take a reactive approach most of the time. An exception was the proactive distribution of a Panel response to the Hayes study in *Nature* and the willingness of the Panel from that point forward to be more outspoken about their own work, as well as that of Hayes. More of these proactive opportunities will be pursued in the coming weeks.

Strategies

- We must be prepared to be aggressive or reactive, depending on the situation.
- Proactive—We will rely primarily on third parties (panel/growers/others) to clarify the state of the science on atrazine and to carry the media torch with Syngenta providing background support.
- Reactive—We will prepare for all scenarios, armed with appropriate communications tools to help us through them.

FILED UNDER SEAL

Atrazine EXPOSED Unsealed by the Court & Exposed by SourceWatch

Tactics

What we've accomplished:

- Handled dozens of interviews in regulatory, trade and consumer media with Tim Pastoor as spokesperson.
- Monitored media and online activity for atrazine (June 2002-present).
- Developed atrazine backgrounder for use by third-party supporters and possible distribution as media fact sheet.
- Compiled/distributed internal comprehensive report on atrazine activists.
- Provided advance notice of atrazine-related studies in *Environmental Health Perspectives* and *Nature*.
- Developed and distributed response by the atrazine science panel to Hayes study in *Environmental Health Perspectives* and *Nature*.
- Developed internal standby statement in response to Hayes study in *Nature*.
- Distributed talking points and panel response to ag industry friends (farm bureaus, grower organizations, other industry associations).
- Facilitated Steve Milloy Fox News column in response to Hayes study in *EHP/Nature*.
- Identified EarthNet list serv as source of online comments from atrazine activists.
- Placed advertorials in Midwest trade publications on farmers as environmental stewards (with the help of herbicides used in conservation tillage).
- Continually updated www.atrazine.com with latest information and media coverage.

What we hope to accomplish:

- Distribute shorter-version atrazine backgrounder to identified support groups.
- Place backgrounder and related materials (including opinion columns) on third-party web sites with their endorsement. Ensure that materials are registered and coded for positive search results.
- Make key word purchases for search engine results.
- Register Syngenta and related partner sites with key online directories.
- Draft two updated opinion columns by two supportive third parties: one on media readiness in proliferating questionable science and another on activist funding and promotion of anti-pesticide studies.
- Distribute opinion columns to targeted news and magazine outlets.
- Reach out to potential media supporters/columnists with the goal of correcting atrazine "myths."
- Conduct media and risk communication training session with v-Fluence for Triazine Network members in Washington DC, January 14-15, 2003. Goal is to prep them as grower spokespeople for media interviews, op-eds and atrazine testimonials.
- Continue to closely monitor various sources of information including media, websites, chat rooms and political insiders.
- Leverage upcoming publication of atrazine science panel studies in the regulatory community and media.
- Inform select ag trade media about atrazine developments through periodic email updates.
- Use the National Farm Broadcast News Service to provide audio actualities (growers, panel members, other third parties) to farm broadcasters who cover atrazine.

FILED UNDER SEAL

Atrazine EXPOSED Unsealed by the Court & Exposed by SourceWatch

Atrazine Communications Strategy SAP—June 2003

CONFIDENTIAL--FOR INTERNAL USE ONLY

Factors Affecting Communications Strategy

- How to “frame” existing panel research on frogs.
- When (and where) to expect publication of next Hayes study implicating Bicep MAGNUM (atrazine + S-metolachlor).

Goals

- Protect the image of the company.
- Help ensure the science and regulatory processes are not interrupted.
- Help ensure the continued availability of atrazine in the US market and abroad.

Strategies

We must be prepared to be aggressive or reactive, depending on the situation.

Proactive—We will rely primarily on a third party (panel) to clarify the state of the science on atrazine and to carry the media torch with Syngenta providing background support.

Reactive—We will prepare for all scenarios, armed with appropriate communications tools to help us through them.

Tactics

- Continue to closely monitor various sources of information including media, web sites, chat rooms and political insiders.
- Identify and prepare spokespeople for Syngenta and atrazine panel
 1. Tim Pastoor for Syngenta
 2. Ron Kendall for Atrazine Panel, with back-up by other panel scientists
 3. Jere White for Triazine Network, with back-up by other key members
- Develop media packet to share with media in attendance at SAP.
 1. Updated atrazine fact sheets (Ford/Hill)
 2. Summary of panel studies (Hosmer/Ford)

FILED UNDER SEAL

Atrazine EXPOSED Unsealed by the Court & Exposed by SourceWatch

3. History of frog malformations (Hosmer/Hendley/Ford)
4. Re-registration timeline (Ford)
5. New farmer testimonials (Ford/Gibbs & Soell)
6. Position statements on:
 - prostate/epidemiology study
 - drinking water
 - 6a2 reporting compliance
 - MoA (water monitoring)
 - amphibian research
 - NRDC allegation of collusion with EPA
7. Syngenta's position on key SAP questions (Ford/Carter/McFarland)
 - Update internal Q&A (Ford/Pastoor/Carter)
 - Develop fact sheets on environmental and human safety of S-metolachlor to have on standby in response to possible Hayes article (Phelps/Hill/Ford/Gibbs & Soell)
 - Personally invite select media to attend the SAP. Target media who have demonstrated a balanced approach in covering the frog issue.
 1. Richard Harris, NPR
 2. John McQuaid, Times-Picayune
 3. Neil Shah, Risk Policy Report
 4. Karen Werner, BNA
 5. Steve Milloy, Fox News
 6. Alex Avery, Center for Global Food Issues
 7. Jack Cushman, NYT
 8. David Hamilton, Wall Street Journal
 9. John Heilprin, Associated Press
 10. Others as appropriate
 - Coordinate internal announcement in advance of SAP to US employees.
 - Coach media spokespeople in key groups:
 1. Growers (Triazine Network, May 13-14)
 2. Science (Atrazine Panel, early June)
 3. Regulatory (early June)
 - Schedule regular, weekly 15- to 30-minute briefings with global atrazine issues team to update on SAP matters.
 - Create a summary of key SAP conclusions and distribute to agriculture trade media and ag editors at regional dailies.

###

May 13, 2003

FILED UNDER SEAL

Atrazine EXPOSED Unsealed by the Court & Exposed by SourceWatch

August 6, 2008

N. Beth Carroll, Ph.D.
Sr. Stewardship Manager
Syngenta Crop Protection, Inc.
P. O. Box 18300
Greensboro, NC 27419-8300

Dear Beth:

The Free Enterprise Project of the National Center for Public Policy Research (NCPPR) requests a grant in the amount of \$25,000 for its ongoing pesticide stewardship cost benefit analysis project.

The NCPPR is a not-for-profit organization organized under Section 501(c)(3) of the Internal Revenue Code. Its tax identification number is 52-1226614.

Please contact me with any questions.

Thank you for your interest and support.

Sincerely,

Steven
Milloy

Digitally signed by Steven Milloy
DN: cn=Steven Milloy, o=FEJ,
email=stevenmilloy@ncppr.com,
dnW.2008.08.26.11.14.43.0000

Steven J. Milloy
Executive Director, Free Enterprise Project/NCPPR
12309 Briarbush Lane
Potomac, MD 20854

Tel: 301-258-2852
Fax: 301-330-3440

FILED UNDER SEAL

Atrazine EXPOSED Unsealed by the Court & Exposed by SourceWatch

From: Carroll Beth USGR
Sent: Tuesday, August 26, 2008 9:43 AM
To: Steven Milloy
Subject: RE: Grant request...

Hi Steve,
Can you re-send the invoice with "pesticide stewardship cost benefit analysis project" instead of "atrazine"

Atrazine stewardship cost benefit analysis project.

Thanks
Beth

From: Steven Milloy [mailto:stevenmilloy@yahoo.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 06, 2008 5:47 PM
To: Carroll Beth USGR
Subject: RE: Grant request...

Hi Beth,

The invoice is attached.

Please note that the nonprofit we are working through now is called the "National Center for Public Policy Research."

Send the check to me as usual and I'll take care of it.

Thanks,

Steve

At 12:39 PM 8/6/2008, you wrote:

Hi Steve,

No it's not too early for an invoice. Send it for \$25,000 and I'll see what I can do. And yes we've seen the preview page for "Poisoned Profits" - It drives me crazy that people believe that "Junk" when we have such a great scientific story about atrazine. By the way we (Elsevier) published "The Triazine Herbicides - 50 Years of Revolutionizing Agriculture" You might want to check it out.

I may give you a call sometime soon to bring you up to speed on a few other issues.

Thanks
Beth

*N. Beth Carroll, Ph.D.
Sr. Stewardship Manager
Syngenta Crop Protection, Inc.
P. O. Box 18300
Greensboro, NC 27419-8300
Phone: (336) 632-7178*

1

CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION - SUBJECT TO PROTECTIVE
ORDER IN ATRAZINE LITIGATION

SYN03470895

FILED UNDER SEAL

Mobile: (336) 542-**Atrazine EXPOSED** Unsealed by the Court & Exposed by SourceWatch
Fax: (336) 632-7065
email: beth.carroll@syngenta.com

The U.S. has more than 2 million farms, with each farmer feeding -- on average -- 144 Americans.

This e-mail, including any attachments, may include confidential and/or proprietary information, and may be used only by the person or entity to which it is addressed. If the reader of this e-mail is not the intended recipient or his or her authorized agent, the reader is hereby notified that any dissemination, distribution or copying of this e-mail is prohibited. If you have received this e-mail in error, please notify the sender by replying to this message and delete this e-mail immediately. Thank you.

-----Original Message-----

From: Steven Milloy [mailto:stevenmilloy@yahoo.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 06, 2008 10:57 AM
To: Carroll Beth USGR
Subject: Grant request...

Hi Beth,

Hope all is well with you.

Is it too early to bother you for a grant?

Best,

Steve

This message may contain confidential information. If you are not the designated recipient, please notify the sender immediately, and delete the original and any copies. Any use of the message by you is prohibited.

12309 BRIARBUSH LANE
POTOMAC, MD 20854

TEL: 301-258-9320
FAX: 301-330-3440

December 3, 2004

N. Beth Carroll, Ph.D.
Sr. Stewardship Manager
Syngenta Crop Protection, Inc.
P. O. Box 18300
Greensboro, NC 27419-8300

Dear Beth:

The Free Enterprise Education Institute requests a grant in the amount of \$15,000 for its ongoing Atrazine stewardship cost benefit analysis project.

FEEI is a not-for-profit organization organized under Section 501(c)(3) of the Internal Revenue Code. Our tax identification number is 81-0634209.

Please contact me with any questions.

Thank you for your interest and support.

Sincerely,

/s/

Steven J. Milloy
President

FILED UNDER SEAL

Atrazine EXPOSED Unsealed by the Court & Exposed by SourceWatch

--

From: Ford Sherry USGR
Sent: Wednesday, August 06, 2008 2:03 PM
To: Carroll Beth USGR
Subject: RE: Poisoned Profits

Thanks for the info. Does he need talking points on atrazine?

Sherry Duvall Ford, APR
Head, External Communications, Crop Protection Syngenta Corporation 410 Swing Road |
Greensboro, NC 27409
336 632 6107 office | 336 209 0457 mobile | 336 632 2290 fax

-----Original Message-----
From: Carroll Beth USGR
Sent: Wednesday, August 06, 2008 3:02 PM
To: Ford Sherry USGR
Subject: Poisoned Profits

FYI
Steve Milloy is doing his weekly column on this book.

FILED UNDER SEAL

Atrazine EXPOSED Unsealed by the Court & Exposed by SourceWatch

--

From: Steven Milloy [stevenmilloy@yahoo.com]
Sent: Tuesday, August 26, 2008 10:17 AM
To: Carroll Beth USGR
Subject: RE: Grant request...
Attachments: NCPPR grant proposal to Syngenta August 6, 2008 25K.pdf

Hi Beth... The revised invoice is attached. Steve

At 10:42 AM 8/26/2008, you wrote:

Hi Steve,
Can you re-send the invoice with "pesticide stewardship cost benefit analysis project" instead of "atrazine"

Atrazine stewardship cost benefit analysis project.
Thanks
Beth

From: Steven Milloy [<mailto:stevenmilloy@yahoo.com>]
Sent: Wednesday, August 06, 2008 5:47 PM
To: Carroll Beth USGR
Subject: RE: Grant request...

Hi Beth,

The invoice is attached.

Please note that the nonprofit we are working through now is called the "National Center for Public Policy Research."

Send the check to me as usual and I'll take care of it.

Thanks,

Steve

At 12:39 PM 8/6/2008, you wrote:

Hi Steve,

No it's not too early for an invoice. Send it for \$25,000 and I'll see what I can do. And yes we've seen the preview page for "Poisoned Profits" - It drives me crazy that people believe that "Junk" when we have such a great scientific story about atrazine. By the way we (Elsevier) published "The Triazine Herbicides - 50 Years of Revolutionizing Agriculture" You might want to check it out.

I may give you a call sometime soon to bring you up to speed on a few other issues.

Thanks
Beth

N. Beth Carroll, Ph.D.

1

CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION - SUBJECT TO PROTECTIVE
ORDER IN ATRAZINE LITIGATION

SYN03470889

FILED UNDER SEAL

Sr. Stewardship **Atrazine EXPOSED** Unsealed by the Court & Exposed by SourceWatch
Syngenta Crop Protection, Inc.
P. O. Box 18300
Greensboro, NC 27419-8300
Phone: (336) 632-7178
Mobile: (336) 549-4353
Fax: (336) 632-7065
email: beth.carroll@syngenta.com

The U.S. has more than 2 million farms, with each farmer feeding -- on average -- 144 Americans.

This e-mail, including any attachments, may include confidential and/or proprietary information, and may be used only by the person or entity to which it is addressed. If the reader of this e-mail is not the intended recipient or his or her authorized agent, the reader is hereby notified that any dissemination, distribution or copying of this e-mail is prohibited. If you have received this e-mail in error, please notify the sender by replying to this message and delete this e-mail immediately. Thank you.

-----Original Message-----

From: Steven Milloy [mailto:stevenmilloy@yahoo.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 06, 2008 10:57 AM
To: Carroll Beth USGR
Subject: Grant request...

Hi Beth,

Hope all is well with you.

Is it too early to bother you for a grant?

Best,

Steve

.....
This message may contain confidential information. If you are not the designated recipient, please notify the sender immediately, and delete the original and any copies. Any use of the message by you is prohibited.

.....
This message may contain confidential information. If you are not the designated recipient, please notify the sender immediately, and delete the original and any copies. Any use of the message by you is prohibited.

FILED UNDER SEAL

Atrazine EXPOSED Unsealed by the Court & Exposed by SourceWatch

From: Ford Sherry USGR
Sent: Thursday, August 07, 2008 9:13 AM
To: Steven Milloy
Subject: RE: Atrazine talking points...

Hi Steve--Thanks for your message. When do you need? I've been buried this morning but can get you something later this a.m.

Sherry Duvall Ford, APR
Head, External Communications, Crop Protection Syngenta Corporation 410 Swing Road |
Greensboro, NC 27409
336 632 6107 office | 336 209 0457 mobile | 336 632 2290 fax -----Original Message-----
From: Steven Milloy [mailto:stevenmilloy@yahoo.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 06, 2008 5:48 PM
To: Ford Sherry USGR
Subject: Atrazine talking points...

Hi Sherry,

Beth Carroll said that you had some Atrazine talking points for me.

Would love to see them.

Thanks,

Steve

Consultants - Science

- Janet Carpenter
- ✓ Leonard Gianessi

- Dr. Chris Wilkinson
- ✓ Dr. Dan Byrd
- Dr. John Graham, Director
- Dr. John Moore
- ? } Dennis Avery
- ? } Alex Avery
- Michael Fumento
- Dr. James Wilson
- Dr. Daniel Woltering
- Dr. Michael Dourson
- Joanne Watters
- ✓ Dr. Judith Hauswirth
- Dr. Marcia vanGemert
- Dr. Gail Charney

Consultants - Policy

- Michael Gough
- Krista Harden
- Kay Holcombe, Exec VP
- Jim Tozzi
- Fred Smith
- Jonathan Adler
- Jack Dutra
- Steve Milloy
- Greg Planicka
- ✓ Bonner Cohen

- NCFAP
- NCFAP
- Univ of Maryland
- JSC
- CTRAPS
- Center for Risk Analysis
- Institute for Evaluating Health Risks
- Hudson Institute
- Hudson Institute
- Hudson Institute
- CTRAPS
- The Weinberg Group
- Toxicology excellence for Risk Assessment
- Novigen
- Jellinek, Schwartz & Connolly
- HealthRisk Strategies

ncfap@ncfap.org
carpenter@ncfap.org

chrisw@jscinc.com
ctraps@radix.net

cgfi@rica.net
aavery@rica.net
fumento@pobox.com
ctraps@radix.net
dawo@weinberggroup.com
DOURSON@tera.com
jwatters@novigensci.com
jhaus@ix.netcom.com
mvang@ix.netcom.com
healthrisk@aol.com

- Cato Institute
- Gordley & Associates
- Policy Directions, Inc.
- CRE
- CEI
- CEI

- Cato Institute
- National environmental Policy Inst.
- Lexington Institute

mgnough@catn.org
202-331-7036 fax
kholcombe@poldir.com
secretary1@mbsdc.com
fsmith@cei.org
jadler@cei.org
jpdutr19@idt.net
milloy@cais.com
gplank@nepi.org
cohen@lexingtoninstitute.org

CP Industry
7. { Jay Vroom
George Roloison
Ray McAllister
Angelina Dugan
Carol Henry
Dave Clark
Joe Mayhew
7. { Janet Flynn
Marcie Francis
Allen James
Doug Fratz
Paula Bodie
Paula's Boss
→ Erica Santella

Green Press
Jeff Winograd
Sue Darcy
✓ Karen Werner
Janet Byron
Steve Gibb
Paul Schrimpf
James Bovard

ACPA
ACPA
ACPA
ACPA
CMA
CMA
CMA
Chlorine Chemistry Council
Chlorine Chemistry Council
RISE
CSMA
OM Scotts
OM Scotts
True Green Chem Lawn

jay@acpa.org
george@acpa.org
ray@acpa.org
angelina@acpa.org
Carol_Henry@cmahq.com
David_Clarke@cmahq.com
Joe_Mayhew@cmahq.com
Janet_Flynn@mail.cmahq.com
Marcie_Francis@cmahq.com
allen@acpa.com
dfratz@cma.org
paula.bodie@scottscsco.com
P.O. Box 490540

Pesticide & Toxic Chemical News
Pesticide Report
BNA
Pesticide & Toxic Chemical News
Risk Policy Report
Farm Chemicals
Columnist

jwinograd@crppress.com
sclacey@erols.com
kwerner@bna.com
bjanet@earthlink.net
iwp2@sprintmail.com
paul_schrimpf@meisterpubl.com
jbovard@cato.org

FILED UNDER SEAL

Atrazine EXPOSED Unsealed by the Court & Exposed by SourceWatch

Leesburg, FL 34749-0540